ATOM INDONESIA JOURNAL
Referee's Report

Article No. : # 418

Title of Paper : The Utilization of Microbial Inoculants Based on Irradiated- Compost on Dryland Remediation to Increase The Growth of King Grass and Maize.

Referee Name :

Comment on Descriptions

1. Title

[ ] Appropriate
[X] Should be changed

2. Abstract

Yes[X] No[ ] Is the length reasonable?
Yes[X] No[ ] Is it an appropriate summary of the content? (

3. Main Text

Yes[ ] No[ ] Is there anything new in this work?
Yes[X] No[ ] Is the relation to previous studies adequately stated?
Yes[X] No[ ] Are the assumption(s) and/or method(s) described comprehensively?
Yes[X] No[ ] Are the new results adequately emphasized?

Line #	Referee's Comments
11	English language corrections are required entirely. Please consult with your colleague whose written English ability is excellent (TOEFL scores of greater than 580).
15-18	This sentence is not appropriate to be put in the introduction section since it has no direct connection with the whole topic of the paper; thus we recommend the author to eliminate it.
20	Please rearrange the sentence to become: a region or forest buffer zone is required to ensure the protection and preservation of forests.
26	…carried out in… (please use space)
36-42	These two sentences need to be connected with another sentence or conjunction as they do not seem to properly connect to each other.
44	…which can be treated ….. (remove the word 'these')
72-73	….in the compost, the sterilization process carrier is then performed.
73	…One of the cleaning methods is….
75-77	Please indicate in the quote about what happened to sterilization results when the author employed a gamma irradiation dose of 25 kGy.
91-94	…. field trials, which included preparation….
93-94	Please replace the phrase "microbial inoculants based irradiated-compost" with "irradiated-compost based microbial inoculants"
98-99	Please replace the phrase "microbial inoculants based irradiated-compost" with "irradiated-compost based microbial inoculants"
97	…used as…
99	..Meanwhile activities…

101	…an area of old well…
103	…used as…
104-105	Please replace the phrase “microbial inoculants based irradiated-compost” with “irradiated-compost based microbial inoculants”
108-109	Please replace the phrase “microbial inoculants based irradiated-compost” with “irradiated-compost based microbial inoculants”
116	…”including”, not “included”
117	…which were…
125	How long was the compost-based carrier materials exposed to the gamma irradiation? What was the gamma source employed in the sterilization?
126-131	Please revise the sentence as it is ambiguous and too long. Moreover the subject, verb and object/adverb are unclear in the sentence.
131-135	Please state in a sentence or two if there were no physical and/or chemical changes to the microbial inoculants following 14 days of incubation.
137-138	Please replace the phrase “microbial inoculants based irradiated-compost” with “irradiated-compost based microbial inoculants”.
141-169	Please check for grammatical errors here, including tenses. The sentences are “too Indonesian”.
171-172	Please replace the phrase “microbial inoculants based irradiated-compost” with “irradiated-compost based microbial inoculants”.
178-233	Ambiguous sentences. Please check for grammatical errors. Again, the sentences are “too Indonesian”.
246-250	Again, it is probably important to state how long the compost-based carrier materials were exposed to the gamma irradiation? What was the gamma source employed in the sterilization?
240-254	Please check for grammatical errors.
261-266	Please delete this sentence.
337-340	In Figure 1, it seems that there are less teak trees at the remediation (B) site I than that of the control (A) site I. This maybe the reasons why the Please offer some explanations here.
267-495	The level of English used in nearly all sentences is quite poor. Please check for grammatical errors entirely.

Final comments and recommendations:

1. Please rewrite the introduction section by providing current references published within 5 years (between 2010 and 2015) otherwise we would not recommend it to be published in AIJ.
2. The title is suggested to be changed to “**The Utilization of Irradiated-Compost Based Microbial Inoculants on Dryland Remediation to Increase The Growth of King Grass and Maize”**
3. For the list of references: please translate all Indonesian references into English, and then add remarks in a bracket such as (in Indonesian) at the end of each reference whose language is Indonesian. Please also be consistent with the names of the authors as to whether upper or lower cases are used.
4. Please indicate and discuss the results of ANOVA and Duncan’s tests more explicitly in the Results and Discussion section.
5. While the investigation is worth publishing, there are significant numbers of grammatical errors in the paper, thus thorough language corrections should be carried out entirely otherwise this paper is, language wise, not appropriate to be published in Atom Indonesia as an international journal. We suggest somebody with TOEFL scores of greater than 600 to proofread this paper before resubmitting.

This paper is recommended to be

[ ] Accepted without further revision

[ ] Accepted with minor revision

[X] Major Revision is required
[ ] Rejected