ATOM INDONESIA

Author's Responses

Article : #530

Name of All Authors :

Article Title : Essential Minerals of Rice in West Java and Its Daily Intake Estimation

E-mail :

Line #	Referee's Comments	Author's Responses
10	Abstract The sample were irradiated with thermal Changed to The samples were irradiated with thermal	It has been corrected according to suggestions. (line 10)
82-87	What is the difference between this research and Mr. M. Wiyono et al. (ref 12). Please explain in the discussion	This activity was focused on the analysis of the content of Co, Cr, Fe, Se and Zn in a sample of rice that was widely consumed in several areas of West Java and also found the level of intake of these elements in the community sourced from rice food in the region. This is different from the previous research conducted by Mr. Wiyono et all (Ref. 12) which focused on several of trace elements content in rice in Pandeglang, Indramayu, Tasikmalaya, Cirebon and several other Java regions. The author has been explained that in discussion section. (line 458-464)
119	demineralization water changed to demineralized water	It has been corrected according to suggestions. (line 123)
122- 124	In this experiment, various types of rice such as <i>Jembar</i> , <i>IR</i> , <i>Setra</i> , <i>Kurmo</i> and <i>Pandan wangi</i> were used. Which type of rice is taken from Bogor, Sukabumi, Bandung, etc market? Please write in the experimental method.	White rice samples were collected from traditional markets in Bogor (kurmo and jembar), Sukabumi (setra and jembar), Bandung (kurmo and jembar), Cirebon (setra), Bekasi (setra), Tasikmalaya (setra and pandan wangi), Indramayu (setra), Lembang (setra), Majalaya (setra),

		Garut (setra, jembar and kurmo), Cianjur (setra and jembar) and Karawang (setra). This description has already written in experimental method section (line 134-144)
128- 131	In this experimen, white rice samples were collected from traditional markets in Bogor, Sukabumi, Bandung, Cirebon, Bekasi, Tasikmalaya, Indramayu, Lembang, Majalaya, Garut, Cianjur and Karawang, West Java. Please explain which type of rice collected from Bogor market, Sukabumi market, etc. Actually colecting the rice from the market as a samples is not appropriate sampling methodology for scientific experiment because we can not guarantee that the rice type is genuine, some times the selers mixed the rice to gain their profit, and it is difficult to trace the data on the rice variety, cultivation system. It is suggested that the rice samples should be colected from the rice field or from the rice breeder so the rice variety, cultivation system and another data can be obtained.	The aim of this research was not only to determine the mineral contents in rice but also to estimate the nutrient intake of local inhabitant observed from rice as main staple food in their diet, that is why the rice samples was taken based on the most frequently consumed in several area of West Java. Further research need to be conducted with some improvement related to rice samples, which obtained from the rice breeder so the rice variety, cultivation system and another data can be completed. (line 134-144 and line 103-108)
269- 270	From this table, there is a big different result from this experiment and E. Damastuti (ref 3) in the case of Co, Cr and Se content of the rice in Bandung. In your results theere is no Co, Cr and Se	From this table, there is a different result from this experiment and E. Damastuti (ref 3), because the difference of type of rice samples. The data of Co, Cr and Se contents of rice from this experiment was already quantified and put in the table. (line 280 and line 295-298)
276- 278	The elemental concentrations of rice sample in twelve regions measured by INAA were presented in Table 4. Changed to The elemental concentrations of rice sample taken from twelve regions measured by INAA were presented in Table 4.	It has been corrected according to suggestions. (line 286-288)
280- 282	The elements Co, Cr and Se Bandung data is processed using previous research. What does it mean?	These sentence has been revised as it has been processed using the obtained results of Co, Cr and Se.
290- 301	Those variations are attributed to many factors such as the mineral composition of the soil, soil type, fertilizer, agricultural chemicals [21], cultivar of plant, weather conditions during the growing, the state of the plants maturity at harvest [22]. Furthermore, This explanation is much more clear if the rice variety is identified.	Setra is trade name of IR 64 rice variety while kurmo and jembar are local rice varieties. This description is already stated in Experimental Method. (line 134 – 144)

309- 310	The cobalt concentration in white rice were range from 0.003 to 0.254 mg/kg whereas the mean concentration was found to be 0.065 mg/kg The cobalt concentration in white rice were range from 0.003 to 0.224 mg/kg (your result, please check carefully your results only) While the cobalt concentration of 0.254 mg/k is result from other Study (ref No 3). Why you put result from other study to your?	It has been corrected according to suggestions. These data has been revised (line 323-324)
324- 325	The chromium element content in the white rice samples range from 0.004 to 0.679 mg/kg. It's should be from ≤0.001 to 0.679 mg/kg (please check the table 4) ???	It has been corrected according to suggestions. (line 338)
410- 412	The average concentration of Zn in Rice from West Java was 15.040 mg/kg with ranged from 8.674-28.83 mg/kg. Please checkfrom 8.558 (Cirebon)???	It has been corrected according to suggestions. (line 427-428)

Please return to Atom Indonesia Editorial Office via e-mail: atomindonesia@batan.go.id and Faximile: 021-7560895.

This original sheet should be returned to: Administrator Atom Indonesia, PPIKSN-BATAN, Gedung 71, Lantai 1, Kawasan Puspiptek Serpong, Tangerang, Indonesia 15310

Author Signature(s)